From Hypocrisy to Ambiguity: The Post-Liberal Paradigm in State- and Peacebuilding

Jan Pospisil, PSRP, Edinburgh Law School

www.politicalsettlements.org
State- and Peacebuilding: A Post-Liberal Paradigm?

• End of ‘liberal peacebuilding’?
  • ‘institution building’ not successful
  • global norms, global governance... retreat?
  • transformation of statebuilding relationships (g7+)

• Transformation of international interventionism?
If so, in what direction, and with what consequences?

www.politicalsettlements.org
‘Era of Disillusionment’

- ‘Era of Disillusionment’ (Bell): result of hypocrisy of ‘compromised peacebuilding’ (Barnett/Zuercher)

- ‘local turn’ (Richmond, Mac Ginty) or post-liberal turn (Chandler) with conceptual innovations:
  - Resilience (US, OECD, Humanitarian Relief)
  - political settlements (UK)

- Concepts used in policy design, strategy, and analysis – broad range of (potential) applications. Interventionist concepts? Political concepts?

www.politicalsettlements.org
‘Resilience’ in State- and Peacebuilding

- ‘fourth generation’ (Pospisil/Kuehn), focusing on ‘state-society relations’
- Incorporates the local level (‘local turn’)
- ‘transforming and channeling radical change and challenges’ (OECD)
- Chandler: ‘post-interventionist paradigm’?

Governed by effects, post-sovereign idea

www.politicalsettlements.org
‘Resilience’: The Counter-Vision

- ‘resilient nations’ (UNDP slogan) – de-politicized focus on effects
- g7+ definition goes one step further: ‘Resilience refers to the ability of social institutions to absorb and adapt to the internal and external shocks and setbacks they are likely to face. Fragility thus implies that the consolidation of nationhood, and the safety, security and well being of the citizens are at risk of a relapse into crisis or violent conflict.’
'Political Settlements'

- Donor creation in 'era of disillusionment'
- Informed by NIE’s critique of traditional institutionalism (institutional transformability)
- elite-focused concept
- social configurations and power structures beyond the formal state structures
- Incorporates informal institutions
‘Political Settlements’: A Variety of Approaches

- Various types of political settlement approaches:
  - ‘resilient political settlement’
  - ‘growth-enhancing political settlement’
  - ‘inclusive political settlement’ ... ‘peace settlement’
- Highly contested concept, means different things to different people
- liberal and post-liberal elements, ambiguous

www.politicalsettlements.org
## Incorporating Ambiguity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Liberalism / Interventionism</th>
<th>Transplanting Institutions</th>
<th>Transforming Institutions</th>
<th>Contextualised Institutions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Interventionist</td>
<td>‘inclusive political settlements’</td>
<td>‘resilience vs fragility’</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post-Interventionist</td>
<td>‘growth-enhancing political settlements’</td>
<td></td>
<td>‘resilient nations’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anti-Interventionist</td>
<td></td>
<td>‘resilient political settlements’</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Concluding Thoughts: Common Language

• Resilience and political settlements produce common language (broad common denominator)

• From hypocrisy (‘compromised peacebuilding’) to ambiguity

• **Enablement of joint efforts** under post-liberal conditions
Concluding Thoughts: Contradictions

- Resilience and political settlements handle two interrelated contradictions:
  - political interventionism vs governing of effects
  - global norms vs post-liberal contextualism
- These contradictions are not solved by the concepts, but incorporated
Concluding Thoughts: Implications

- Resilience and political settlements flag the **end of liberal internationalism**
- **Consequences are challenging** for development, and state- and peacebuilding as common international efforts:
  - broadening of common denominators: scope for pooled action shrinks
  - increasing problems with joint interventionism, compacts, funding pools, joint strategies
  - more political interventions may result in rapidly shifting coalitions