AddressingHistory - crowdsourcing a nation’s past

Abstract

This paper charts the development and delivery of a Web 2.0 informed community engagement tool and Application Programming Interface (API) developed at EDINA in partnership with the National Library of Scotland, as part of the JISC Digitisation and e-Content Programme. The AddressingHistory web tool enables members of the community, both within and beyond academia (particularly local history groups and genealogists), to enhance and combine data from digitised historical Scottish Post Office Directories with contemporaneous large-scale historical maps. The paper discusses the background to Post Office Directories and the corresponding geo-referenced old maps for Scotland, the technical platforms deployed including sustainable software components, and web applications and services. It also examines issues relating to data parsing, user generated content (UGC) created by the community including geo-referencing, and the use of social media amplification for community engagement and future directions. To conclude, the paper argues that to be successful online crowdsourcing tools such as the one developed for this project require a critical mass of content to fully engage the user community and that such success will ultimately be measured by continual and extended use within the wider community.

Introduction

The AddressingHistory project was funded as part of the Developing Community Content strand of the JISC Digitisation and e-Content Programme and led by EDINA National Data Centre at the University of Edinburgh, exploiting substantial in-house experience with mapping, geo-parsing and geo-referencing data.

The aim of the project was to create an online engagement tool built using open standards, to enable members of the community, both within and beyond academia (particularly local history groups and genealogists), to combine and enhance data from digitised historical Scottish Post Office Directories with contemporaneous large-scale historical maps. Both digitised resources (maps and directories) were provided, without restriction, by project partner National Library of Scotland (NLS) who also shared extensive digital mapping and geo-coding expertise.

AddressingHistory was informed by a number of initiatives exploring the possibilities of crowdsourcing data or ‘volunteering information’, in particular projects which have engaged wider audiences in detecting errors in OCR and the editing or adding of locations.

The concept of crowdsourcing, the breaking up of large data tasks into smaller distributable sub-tasks, is certainly not new. The compilation of the Oxford English Dictionary in the late nineteenth century (as chronicled in Winchester 1998), the Mass Observation Archive at the University of Sussex (as discussed in e.g. Sheridan 1994) and Sir Dudley Stamp’s 1930s Land Utilisation Survey of Britain (Stamp 1931) offer famous examples of the power of combining data collected or validated by keen amateur volunteers. The internet and the emergence of Web 2.0 (O’Reilly 2005) technologies have enabled crowdsourcing projects to take place on a much more rapid and global scale. Academic applications of crowdsourcing were led by Citizen Science projects, such as Foldit® and GalaxyZoo®, which enabled participants to directly contribute ‘user generated content’ or edit controlled and
constrained types of data, to communicate with others in the community and develop their understanding of the topic as a result of their participation.

The Australian Newspapers Digitisation Programme, which began in 2007 and now forms part of “Trove”, was one of the most successful early examples of crowdsourcing to detect and correct OCR errors perhaps because of the attempt to pre-empt and mitigate for risks associated with public contribution of data (as discussed in Holley 2009). Transcribe Bentha, a project to transcribe the digitised Jeremy Bentham archive, have further explored the technological, community participation, and validation challenges associated with OCR crowdsourcing projects (Terras 2010).

Motivations for participating in crowdsourcing projects can vary wildly from very personal and immediate needs to access and record data (Ziemke 2012) to enthusiasm for a hobby or interest (Chris Batt Consulting 2009), to long term interests in being part of a community (Zeitlyn 2003). Raddick et al (2010) found that most GalaxyZoo contributors did not have a single motivation with an interest in the subject, Astronomy, being a key driver but also sitting alongside an interest in contributing to original research or the fun of the task at hand. Causer and Wallace (2012), writing about Transcribe Bentham, note the distinction between a “community” and a “crowd” project and define their own participants as including both a tight knit community of regular contributors and a larger crowd of occasional or one-off contributors. Echoing the findings of the RunCoco initiative’s guidance (RunCoco 2011), Causer and Wallace also found that a combination of traditional media, web 2.0 tools and in-person communications were crucial for reaching out to different types of audiences and potential contributors.

Volunteered geographic information (VGI) has risen to prominence through the emergence of a range of interactive web tools and services harnessing the ‘Geoweb’ to create and disseminate geographic data provided voluntarily by individuals (Goodchild et al, 2007). FieldScope, a web-based platform to support the National Geographic Community Geography Initiative is a good example of a collaboration tool designed to support and engage citizen scientists in geographical investigations of real-world issues. The publication ‘Crowdsourcing Geographic Knowledge’ (Sui et al 2013) further explores a range of public participation initiatives, emerging technologies and new challenges in a range of spatial settings some of which find resonance with the conceptual development of the Addressing History web tool.

Scottish Post Office Directories

Historic Post Office Directories, precursors to modern day Yellow Pages, offer a fine-grained spatial and temporal view on important social, economic and demographic circumstances. For Scotland there are currently over 700 such directories spanning the period 1783 – 1912, which have been scanned, undergone OCR (Optical Character Recognition) processing, and have been published by the NLS in conjunction with the non-profit Internet Archive in an on-going initiative.
The directories emerged during the late seventeenth century to meet the demand for accurate information about trade and industry due to the expansion of commerce during this period. They were published more frequently than the census and generally had information about local facilities, institutions and associations, listings for private residents, traders, trades and professions, sometimes details of notable people, and advertisements. They are also one of relatively few historical records of the lives of women, particularly widowed women.

The ways in which publishers collected data for the directories varied considerably. Some obtained information by personal canvassing and combined the results with existing trade listings. Other publishers invited citizens to send in their names together with a small payment if they wanted to be included in the directory.

By the early nineteenth century methods of compilation were more organised. In part, this reflected the growing links between directories and the Post Office. Many postal officials turned their hand to directory publishing as a means of both aiding their work and augmenting their income. Information was collected by letter carriers, who circulated forms during their postal rounds, and also delivered the finished directory on commission.

Each annual Scottish Post Office Directory includes an alphabetical list, known as the general directory of a town’s or county’s inhabitants, making it easy to find out where people lived and, in some cases, how they were employed at that time.

In addition to the general directory, most of Scotland’s Post Office Directories include a street directory and a trades directory, an alphabetical listing of people by their address and professions. A range of other directories may also be found including those listing banks and banking companies; clergymen and places of worship; educational institutions and teachers by their subject; juridical institutions and practitioners; medical and surgical institutions and practitioners; Chief Officers of State, Peers of Scotland, and Members of Parliament. Additionally, one of the most appealing parts of the Post Office Directories is the advertisements, which give a valuable insight into society and lifestyle for a particular era.
The directories offer a wealth of detailed information regarding residential names, occupations and addresses and are therefore a fitting resource for genealogical study. Post Office Directories are also recognised as being of great importance in establishing and understanding commerce and trading patterns within Scotland during the previous centuries.

Phase 1 (Apr. - Sept., 2010) of the project focused on three volumes (1784-5; 1865; 1905-6) of the Edinburgh digitised Post Office Directories (held in XML format in a database structure) and mapping from the same periods. The interface and back-end storage solutions developed were scalable and as far as is practicable, designed to be self-standing so that multiple independent instances of the tool and API could be supported and customised for different audiences and purposes.

One significant deficiency of the digitised directories, which the AddressingHistory online tool aimed to redress by ‘crowd sourcing’, is that addresses are not geo-referenced. Geo-referencing has the potential to enhance the collection by enabling spatial search and discovery. For instance, the addition of the geo-reference permits a map-based metaphor to be used in the exploration and visualisation of the resource e.g. the historic distribution of shipwrights in Edinburgh can be plotted on a base map or the map itself can be used to explore the spatial distribution of selected phenomena (and their variation over time). Geo-referencing the directories also opens up the potential for creating personalised maps illustrating family histories, maps tracking changes in local communities, and maps linking to other digitised materials such as census records and geo-referenced images.

**Digitised Historic Mapping**

The second set of resources that the project exploits are digitised maps. The NLS' Map Library is one of the ten largest in the world, with unrivalled collections: as the Library of the Faculty of Advocates from 1689, maps of Edinburgh were actively collected; as a Copyright Library (following the 1710 Copyright Act), the collections are particularly strong in the printed mapping of Scotland. Since 1998, NLS Map Library has scanned over 20,000 historical maps of Scotland, including over 500 of
Edinburgh and its environs available for viewing as high-resolution colour images. It is the pre-
existence of large scale geo-referenced maps, against which the historic Post Office Directories are 
assessed and contextualised, that allows the geo-referencing down to individual house addresses to 
be accomplished. The availability of large scale historic maps of the same era allow users of the online 
tool to attach a geo-reference to a particular Post Office Directory address by simply clicking on the 
map.

The user interface to the tool and associated API was designed to be intuitive and easy-to-use to 
encourage researchers, local history societies, genealogists and members of the wider community to 
discover, explore and contribute to rich records of social history, and to enable them to create their 
own related maps and data sets for both academic and personal research. These were also developed 
to be sympathetic to tools developed by related projects including Visualising Urban Geographies 
(VUG), an online resource developing new insights into the spatial character and historical 
development of Edinburgh.

A combination of automated geo-referencing (using the Google geocoding API) and crowd-sourcing of 
the Post Office Directory records has the potential to lead to a fully geo-coded version of the digitised 
directories, meaning that a key element in determining the success of the project has been public 
participation and collaboration. This was encouraged and supported through extensive community 
outreach particularly via ongoing communication with a Project Advisory Board, Edinburgh Beltane\(^1\), 
the College of Humanities and Social Sciences Knowledge Transfer Office as well as online through 
social media channels. These activities are described in more detail in the Social Media and 
Community Engagement sections later in this article.

A second phase of internal funding sought to develop functionality complementary to the original 
work whilst focusing upon both sustainability and interoperability to resonate with JISC’s vision to 
build durable deliverables\(^4\). Work included streamlining data pre-processing and loading processes 
with a view to providing ‘cleaner’ output, spatial searching using bounding boxes, a re-evaluation and 
enhancement of the Post Office Directory and geocoding parsing processes. To streamline and 
improve the ‘searchability’ of content computer-generated metadata was incorporated into Post 
Office Directory entries such as categorising places and professions (through the use of Standard 
Industrial Classification (SIC) codes)\(^6\). Support for entries with multiple addresses (i.e. entries where 
individuals may have a domestic address and one or more business address) was also improved for 
searching and editing purposes.

**Parsing**

To assist the geo-referencing process, address entries from each of the directories were parsed using 
Google’s geocoding API\(^8\) in order to assign a geo-reference to each address encountered in the XML 
database. There were issues with the legibility of the OCR’d text (especially for the directory for the 
earlier period) including addresses, in addition to period addresses no longer being in existence or 
having suffered name changes. Thus within the interface a ranking mechanism makes explicit the 
relative ‘accuracy’ of this “mass” geo-coded content.

In this phase of work Post Office Directory configuration files, which are used to configure the parser 
settings, were taken outside of the parser itself. This enables the parser to be adapted to different 
formats and conventions in different directories. Most importantly the configuration files are now 
editable meaning that rules and conventions required to successfully parse the directory content can 
be augmented and refined by expert users. For instance, if a user observes repeated OCR errors

---

\(^1\) Edinburgh Beltane was established as a National Co-ordinating Centre for Public Engagement (NCCPE) Beacon for Public Engagement. More information can be found at http://www.publicengagement.ac.uk/about/beacons/edinburgh-beltane. The NCCPE Beacons programme has now come to the end and Edinburgh Beltane has since rebranded to “Beltane Public Engagement Network” and may be found at http://www.beltanenetwork.org/.
resulting from the structure of a Post Office Directory, such as anomalous line returns, mis-spellings, textual abbreviations and the like, they are empowered to make the appropriate edits to address those issues.

The tool and API have also been developed alongside improvements to the technical platform. The improvements facilitate Post Office Directory parsing on request (i.e. for an area of the country or era not currently covered by the tool and API) on the understanding that the requesting body or individual has sufficient technical expertise to initiate and manage the parsing process (monitored by EDINA). Thus in effect three crowdsourcing opportunities are now supported: edits at the level of the record (‘micro’ level); at the level of the configuration files (‘meso’ level); and at the individual Post Office Directory (‘macro’ level).
A key element to any crowdsourcing initiative is a critical mass of content sufficient to engender continued community interest and subsequent engagement. With this in mind additional content for Edinburgh as well as Glasgow and Aberdeen for 1881 & 1891 to coincide with census years were added to the tool and API. The addition of Glasgow introduces Scotland’s biggest population centre and the addition of Aberdeen expands AddressingHistory beyond Scotland’s ‘Central Belt’.

At time of writing (October 2012) it is too early to say whether extending both spatial and temporal extents have had positive impact on user participation.
Technologies

The AddressingHistory tool and API were built with resilience and sustainability in mind, opting for Open Source software where possible to allow greater flexibility and a feature-rich application.

AddressingHistory is built as a typical 3-tier web application. For the user-facing client presentation component, standards such as XHTML, CSS and other relevant W3C web standards (i.e. for images etc) were employed as recommended by JISC. The web interface is supported by mainstream browsers and OGC-compliant applications including the Web Map Service (WMS) interface standard. OpenLayers, an open source JavaScript library for displaying map data in web browsers (with no server-side dependencies) was used for the mapping components.

The Application Programming Interface (API), allowing access to the raw data in multiple output formats, is accessible via a RESTful web service. The terms of the API and the variety of formats available ensures that the content is highly accessible and may be reused in standard research tools including GIS, combined with data from other projects, included in mash-ups or reimagined via novel interfaces.

Development

The project followed best practice for technical development, making extensive use of a number of common and well-established resources including the Java SDK, Spring MVC framework and the jQuery Javascript libraries. Unit testing was performed via the JUnit libraries.

Development initially began by scoping the application’s requirements, designing a database structure to store the information contained in the Post Office Directories in conjunction with pre-processing and data-loading software. The structural interpretation and translation of the varied content from the directories, through the development of the Post Office Directory parser, proved to be a time consuming exercise. The directory data was processed, and additional metadata such as the locations of addresses were added to the database.

The API, following JISC recommendations for API Good Practiceiv was designed to allow access to the raw data using a number of HTTP GET queries including a parameter which allows web developers to specify the format (JSON, KML or TXT) they want the result returned in.

The client application was built upon the API, featuring web-based mapping. To the OpenLayers mapping, we added a collection of historical maps from NLS, contemporary to Post Office Directories of interest. A user registration system, facilities to edit the stored data and suggest specific changes were added towards the end of the development, together with various enhancements – including a view to the original scanned directory pages, a feature which provides crucial context and verification for academic researchers.

All components of the web accessible service and API are hosted via a Solaris 10 virtual container, together with an established PostgreSQL database, hosted at EDINA. Throughout the project, the source code, tests and configuration files were stored in a GIT source control repository. Software builds and releases were automated via the Apache Maven software project management tool. Documentation is stored in a shared repository.

The Post Office Directory parser code is available on Github under a GPL (General Public License)iv and is also hosted on the Official Python Programming Websitevil.

Augmented Reality
Using the BuildAR CMS tool an AddressingHistory layer has been developed and published for use with the ‘Layar’ Application for a range of mobile platforms including iPhone or Android. Raw ASCII Points of Interest (POIs) and associated metadata are uploaded as a set of Google Map co-ordinates. POIs (e.g. each profession or SIC Code) are then associated with an image or symbol representative of said POI. The AddressingHistory layer works with the Layar Application to compare information about your current location (from your phone) and the geo-referenced entries in AddressingHistory to work out which historical residents and businesses used to be located near where you are standing at that moment. This means that you can point your phone’s camera in a direction and see clickable markers appear for each historical address superimposed on a live view of the street. Currently the Layar Application is configured for content from Edinburgh only.

![Screen capture of the AddressingHistory Augmented Reality Layer.](image)

**User Generated Content**

The AddressingHistory project raised a number of issues regarding user generated content (UGC) created by the community such as mediation, validation and cross-checking. At present the AddressingHistory team retain the option to check UGC and do so on a periodic basis. As part of a sustainability plan it is envisaged that a more routine process for validation can be established utilising a combination of automatic validity checks where sufficient user contributions exist for multiple edits to be compared. Opportunity for an ‘engaged user group’ comprising active members of the user community to volunteer to conduct validation and cross-checking of UGC through a
devolved mediation process – as used in the Wikipedia model – may also be an appropriate approach given the large number of motivated expert ‘amateurs’ within the local and family history community.

Users must register to edit entries in AddressingHistory and any edit is therefore easily traced back to the user. Data changes are logged meaning that inappropriate behaviour (e.g. spam) or inaccurate UGC can be identified and the user can be contacted in order to justify behaviour or explain particularly unusual editing patterns. Potentially a username can be prevented from editing further although at time of writing no problems with malicious edits have been experienced.

Although UGC is displayed in the web interface, AddressingHistory has been designed so that the original database and the database containing the UGC are maintained as separate instances which ensures that any inaccurate or inappropriate user generated content can easily be removed without compromising the authority of the core database.

Fig. 5. The AddressingHistory ‘community’ badge designed for use by bloggers, and those with local history websites.

Social Media

From the outset of the project there was an understanding of the importance of engaging with a broad community of users and doing so rapidly. A steering committee, established at the outset of the project, informed development of a mechanism whereby the ‘crowd’ could contribute to the creation of a fully geo-coded version of the digitised directories. There was also a need to raise awareness of the project whilst the AddressingHistory tool was still under development in order to ensure potential users and advocates were actively involved in the project before the tool launched.

During the initial scoping process the project team began to work with Edinburgh Beltane and with the University of Edinburgh College of Humanities and Social Sciences Knowledge Transfer Office, and Communication and Marketing. Each organisation provided support in identifying key stakeholders for the project, advice on best practice and for connecting to a wide range of interested organisations and stakeholders. Working in partnership in this way enabled the project team to quickly establish effective approaches to engage several identified key audiences: researchers and academics concerned with the quality and coverage of the data; local historians with a specific interest in Edinburgh history; genealogists investigating specific names within the data; students at school and at undergraduate and post graduate levels undertaking focused projects related to the data.

Social media channels were deployed to engage the public, to develop links within the local and family history communities, and to act as a vehicle to expose the tool and API to a wider audience. The following section describes both method and mechanism used to engender public collaboration and community engagement

Building and Developing Community Connections

At the outset of the project an information page was created on the EDINA website and later updated to connect to additional AddressingHistory presences. A locally hosted WordPress blog was deployed as the project’s website and hub for communicating and engaging with our target audiences.
One of the central challenges was the need to establish a motivated ‘crowd’ to contribute content to AddressingHistory post-launch. The blog was therefore used to share both core project progress and content with broader appeal such as guest blog posts and features on upcoming events or reports from those attended.

The blog had to remain relevant for funders, academic and organisational audiences. However the establishment of a Facebook page provided a more informal and accessible space for audiences, particularly those from local and family history backgrounds, to engage, share and recommend blog posts, updates or related materials. These presences were complemented with a Twitter profile (@addresshistory) which proved to be unexpectedly effective for building the network around the project, virally sharing updates and reaching out to key figures from target audiences such as notable academics, widely read bloggers, and heritage organisations.

Community Engagement

From the outset the project team encouraged blogging and discussion of the project and the Project Officer proactively sought out potential contacts, followers, and bloggers, responding to comments on the project to ensure that mentions were complemented with links to the website and that questions were responded to. Rewarding interest and participation encouraged ongoing support and engagement with the project. The intent was to create an atmosphere of openness and participation, recognising contributions from stakeholders and thus reflecting that the tool being created would be editable, open, and accessible for anyone who wishes to explore or participate in improving it.

Fig. 6: Still from the "Digitising the Post Office Directories for AddressingHistory" video hosted on YouTube. The still shows Zaria, from the Internet Archive, scanning Post Office Directories whilst talking about the digitisation process.
In the run up to launch a number of key resources were made available to encourage both bloggers and mainstream press to engage with the online tool and the coverage of it’s launch. High resolution images of the physical directories and maps were captured and made available under Creative Commons license with an encouragement to bloggers and journalists to use these images. Two videos were also created and shared via YouTube – again with an explicit encouragement to share in readiness for launch with one explaining the process of digitising the resources included in AddressingHistory, and the other placing these resources, and their relevance, into context. Finally several online badges were created to provide a visual way for users, key bloggers, and organisational websites to connect to and show support for AddressingHistory.

AddressingHistory benefited greatly from the support of existing genealogy and local history bloggers and online communities, receiving regular mentions and links from a wide variety of sites and discussion boards. The social media and web presences helped reach out to many interested parties.

---


3 Indeed many of the social media monitoring techniques that were trialled on AddressingHistory are now successfully being used to better monitor social media mentions of other EDINA projects and services.
Another game processed better delivering Edinburgh interesting crowds at complements history presences. Entries were made by the work of extant research. The sampled corpus to the Great Britain. This also involved investigating how best to expand and develop the machines aspects of AddressingHistory. For example there are opportunities to draw upon game-mechanics, rewarding users immediately for their edits and additions to the data, and challenging users to contribute to a broader array of edits for fun and competition rather than focusing only on the small number of addresses of immediate research interest.

Another avenue of development under consideration is the inclusion of facilities to upload and attach geo-referenced content such as images, census records, videos and sound files to AddressingHistory entries in the database. In this way, the directories would be extended to include photographs of people, buildings, landmarks thus enriching the resource and broadening both utility and appeal, and better enabling contributors to share and showcase their contributions to AddressingHistory in the context of their personal research.

Context versus Content

“A major feature of this project is the offer of maps, and maps which enable the user to explore and present historical information spatially. The outcome is visually attractive and exciting. There is a danger that the fun of producing the map acts as a barrier to thinking about what is happening.”
- Quote from Professor Robert Morris at the AddressingHistory Launch Event

Professor Robert Morris, Emeritus Professor of Social and Economic History at the University of Edinburgh who provided the introductory presentation at the AddressingHistory launch had reservations regarding context versus content. He indicated that, where applicable, explanatory notes providing information about background, construct and content of the original directory listings should be made explicit. In addition, underlying assumptions and rules about both the structure of the processed data and the translation of the structured data into a consumable and interactive format should be made clear.

The project team continues to be committed to making AddressingHistory useful, relevant and interesting both to those engaged in academic research and those engaging in personal research or
discovery. Professor Morris’s concerns are partly addressed through the inclusion within the interface of a range of Help documents (including a Post Office Directory Guide and People, Place & Profession Search Guides), an API Guide and Frequently Asked Questions, although there is scope for further work to explain and contextualise the AddressingHistory data.

**Sustainability**

In accordance with the project plan the AddressingHistory project partners were committed to supporting the resource for a minimum of one year whilst it gathered community traction. During this time consideration was made to the processes necessary for ongoing dissemination, community take-up of the deliverables and their adoption by the community. AddressingHistory aims to achieve this through those social media channels established as part of the project and an on-going relationship with Edinburgh Beltane\(^4\) and, in turn, to appropriate organisations engaged in local and family history projects.

Given the broad applicability of the resource it is envisaged that a range of communities may be interested in the longer term curation and continuance of the project tools e.g. the OpenStreetMap\(^{xxviii}\) community has an active user base interested in both contemporary and historical addresses. It is also anticipated that the active involvement of ‘engaged users’ throughout the project and beyond will provide direction on longer term sustainability issues.

The project team are scoping a number of sustainable business models based on levels of demand provided they remain consistent with the underlying open philosophy, namely: revenue generation through an online donations facility; subscription model (e.g. per annum, per month, per use); a ‘freemium model’ (e.g. free API download of a certain number of records with payment being required for further downloads); academic advertising.

---

\(^4\) The partnership cultivated between AddressingHistory and Edinburgh Research & Innovation and Edinburgh Beltane has initiated ongoing communications between EDINA and both organisations with a view to enhancing community engagement from broader service level perspectives.
Conclusion

AddressingHistory was an ambitious project which combined a range of technologies from data processing and database design, to Web 2.0 and web mapping services. The initial processing of data extracted from the historical directories through OCR, presented a unique challenge in terms of data errors, lack of structure, and data inconsistencies both within and across individual Post Office Directories. Much was achieved within the relatively short project phases in terms of public engagement and amplification through social media channels, and the delivery of a robust and scalable website and API capable of empowering the ‘crowd’ with the facility to search and edit georeferenced content from the Scottish Post Office Directories and digitised historic maps from the same era. However, gauging the success of the project goes beyond the delivery of engaging and innovative online tools. It will ultimately be measured by continual and extended use within the wider community.

Note: A free to access index for the Glasgow Post Office Directories from 1783-1911 is now available - http://bizdirs.from-mt.com/glasgow/
Bibliography


Endnotes


ii EDINA. “EDINA website”. http://www.edina.ac.uk/ (accessed 8 Jan 2013)


ix http://geo.nls.uk/maps (accessed 8 Jan 2013)


EDINA. “AddressingHistory”. http://addressinghistory.blogs.edina.ac.uk/ (accessed 8 Jan 2013)


EDINA. “AddressingHistory YouTube channel”. http://www.youtube.com/user/AddressingHistory (accessed 8 Jan 2013)


Kerr, P. “a’spaidsearachd agus a’meòrachadh (wandering and wondering)”. http://direcleit.blogspot.co.uk/ (accessed 8 Jan 2013)


EDINA. “AddressingHistory”. http://addressinghistory.edina.ac.uk/ (accessed 8 Jan 2013)