Scotland’s draft interim constitution: clear-sighted and sensible, or an SNP power-play?

The Scottish Government recently published *The Scottish Independence Bill: A Consultation on an Interim Constitution for Scotland*, the document which would form the basis of the constitutional arrangements for Scotland in the event of a 'Yes' vote in the forthcoming independence referendum. **Democratic Audit** asked expert constitutional thinkers to give their views on whether the document is fit for purpose.

The interim constitution is short and clear. It also sets out a positive vision for Scotland. So I shouldn’t be churlish. But it contains a number of policy issues which, rather than being locked away in a constitution, should be left to the competence of an independent Scottish Parliament. And if we start with this as a template, the permanent constitution is likely to be even more detailed and policy-laden.

If Scots do take the momentous step of voting Yes in the referendum why not let the parliament of a new state find its own feet? Scottish nationalists dislike Westminster’s authority over Scotland, but let’s not blame parliamentary democracy for this. Parliament’s supremacy has been a flexible and democratic model. A danger is that this will be swapped for a constitution drafted by the most vocal vested interests and that judges will become the most important politicians in an independent Scotland.

If the people do vote Yes in September why not leave political power in their hands, to be exercised by their parliament and, for big decisions, by the people themselves through future referendums?

*The Scottish Parliament (Credit: Wojtek Gurak, CC BY NC 2.0)*

**Professor Stephen Tierney, Director, Edinburgh Centre for Constitutional Law**

http://www.democraticaudit.com/?p=6185
The policy of the Scottish Government, outlined most coherently in Scotland’s Future, is not just to secure an independent Scotland, but also to secure one in which the Scottish National Party continues to control the Parliament and Government. Its ambitious, many would say, unrealistic, policies which are part of its independence plan, are the basis of the programme that it would put, in the event of a ‘yes’ vote to the Scottish people in the Scottish Parliamentary elections in 2016 thus hoping to extend its current place in power from 2007 at least until 2021.

In that interim period Scotland would be governed by a single chamber Parliament, possibly with an SNP majority government elected just prior to independence, with no counter-availing constitutional checks and balances – other than those provided, in the period immediately following a ‘yes’ vote, by the UK Parliament and Government in the bargaining over the terms of independence. But the SNP Scottish Government plans, even in advance of the conclusion of negotiations, to assume the constitutional powers reserved to the UK Parliament by the devolution referendum of 1997.

In the event of a ‘yes’ vote the liberties of Scottish citizens may well, paradoxically, depend on the ability of the UK Government and Parliament to ensure that there is ample protection embedded in the terms of the independence agreement – because the Scottish Government has no interest in checks and balances on its power in the formative immediate post-independence years.

**Note:** click here to see an extended version of Norman’s contribution

---

Kyle Thornton, Chair of the Scottish Youth Parliament

If Scotland were to become independent, I would argue strongly we need a process which is inclusive of the whole population, especially our young people.

The guiding document of a new nation cannot be one which is Government-led. It must be from the people, for the people and approved by the people as a whole. It is an opportunity to set out our values and enshrine safeguards for our democracy and society and so we must take the time to debate and discuss what our constitution should say and crucially, that those left to draft a new constitution must be empowered to have a national conversation about what it is that a newly independent nation would want to see in its founding document.

**Note:** this piece represents the views of the contributors, and not those of Democratic Audit or the LSE. Please read our comments policy before posting. The shortened URL for this post is: [http://buff.ly/1j7T948](http://buff.ly/1j7T948)
Scotland’s draft interim constitution: clear-sighted and sensible, or an SNP power-play? http://t.co/lC45eRLiV9  http://t.co/Z83GbLADJl

Scotland’s draft interim constitution: Clear-sighted and sensible, or an SNP power-play? http://t.co/7LZF0a7yNt

“Unionists as well as nationalists should welcome such a clear-headed document as this constitution”, says Ian McLean http://t.co/9sACcNEoFt

Scotland’s draft interim constitution: Clear-sighted and sensible, or an SNP power-play? http://t.co/tGBqMg4DYn

This new e-collection from Democratic Audit, edited by DA’s Sean Kippin and Richard Berry, seeks to promote the best  Read More »

The 2012 Democratic Audit

Our latest (2012) Audit of democracy in the UK has now been published and is available here Read More »

Democratic Audio podcast
The lack of gender balance in positions of power remains untackled buff.ly/1EYXYDK

 Democracy is the biggest loser when parliament descends into farce

 Democracy is the biggest loser when parliament descends into farce

 The party leaders must ensure that the next set of election debates don’t focus solely on England

 The party leaders must ensure that the next set of election debates don’t focus solely on England

 The lack of gender balance in positions of power remains untackled

 The lack of gender balance in positions of power remains untackled

 The PwC report on Tower Hamlets highlights fundamental tensions in local democracy, not always thought through clearly in new mayoral systems

 The PwC report on Tower Hamlets highlights fundamental tensions in local democracy, not always thought through clearly in new mayoral systems

 Book Review: The Price of Public Intellectuals by Raphael Sassower

 Book Review: The Price of Public Intellectuals by Raphael Sassower

 Painting in primary colours: political populism and the muted mainstream

 Painting in primary colours: political populism and the muted mainstream

 The only way to protect citizens from their governments is to divide sovereign authority between the national and international levels

 The only way to protect citizens from their governments is to divide sovereign authority between the national and international levels

 ‘Civic Conversations’ facilitated by social media can help to reshape the relationship between citizens and local government

 ‘Civic Conversations’ facilitated by social media can help to reshape the relationship between citizens and local government

 Scotland’s draft interim constitution: clear-sighted and sensible, or an SNP power-pla...
Scotland’s draft interim constitution: clear-sighted and sensible, or an SNP power-pla...

Future of the Union

Democratic Audit features a series of posts exploring the UK’s future prospects as a political union. Read More

Most popular posts

- The Public Service Industry: A constitutional blasphemy and a democratic perversion
- The Government’s proposal for an ‘English only’ stage in the House of Commons could create problems
- MPs with slim majorities and frontbenchers are the most prolific parliamentary tweeters
- Online political discussions tend to be less civil when the participants are anonymous
- Highly educated young people are less likely to vote than older people with much lower levels of attainment
- A response to Roger Scruton: no, democracy is not overrated
- The Scottish independence referendum need not include the rest of the UK, even though they are affected
- ern Irelan Assembly elections show internal party cultures, not the electoral system, prevent equal opportunities for women in politics
- Sell Brand has a point about disillusionment with politics, but he is wrong when he says young people shouldn’t vote
- Democracy experts are divided on Lord Stevens’ proposals to reform police accountability

Democracy Online

Democratic Audit features a series of posts exploring how the internet is transforming democracy. Read More

Categories

- Achieving accountable government
- Book reviews
- Building sub-national government
- Crowdsourcing the Constitution
- Democratic Audit Shorts
- Euro Elections Briefings
- Extending human and civic rights
- Improving voting and elections
- Informing and engaging citizens
- Involving young people in democracy
- Modernising parliamentary democracy
- Uncategorized

Blogroll

- 18 Gower Street (Birkbeck)
- 18 Degrees
- Ballots and Bullets (Nottingham University)
- Bernard Crick Centre
- Campaign for Freedom of Information
- Citizenship Foundation
- Constitution UK: Crowdsourcing the UK’s constitution
- Dan Ielmini
- Eastminster (University of East Anglia)
- Elections etc
- Ethnic Politics
- Future of the UK and Scotland
- INLOGOV (Birmingham University)
- International IDEA
- Involve
- Local Government Chronicle
- Lords of the Blog
- LSE British Politics and Policy Blog
- LSE Europe Blog
- LSE Impact of Social Sciences Blog
- LSE Review of Books
- New Political Communication Unit (Royal Holloway)
- Nick Peers’s Blog @ IPPR
- Open Knowledge Foundation
- Our Democratic Heritage
- OurKingdom
- Political Studies Association
- Politics in Spires
- politics upside down (Southampton University)
- PSA Women and Politics
- Public law for everyone

Scotland’s draft interim constitution: clear-sighted and sensible, or an SNP power-pla...