The effect of permeability on the flow past permeable disks at low Reynolds numbers

Citation for published version:

Digital Object Identifier (DOI):
10.1063/1.5001342

Link:
Link to publication record in Edinburgh Research Explorer

Document Version:
Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

Published In:
Physics of Fluids
The effect of permeability on the flow past permeable disks at low Reynolds numbers
Cathal Cummins, Ignazio Maria Viola, Enrico Mastropaolo, and Naomi Nakayama

Citation: Physics of Fluids 29, 097103 (2017); doi: 10.1063/1.5001342
View online: http://dx.doi.org/10.1063/1.5001342
View Table of Contents: http://aip.scitation.org/toc/phf/29/9
Published by the American Institute of Physics

Articles you may be interested in
Instability of a binary liquid film flowing down a slippery heated plate
Physics of Fluids 29, 092105 (2017); 10.1063/1.4989558

Interaction of vortex ring with a stratified finite thickness interface
Physics of Fluids 29, 093602 (2017); 10.1063/1.4994264

Novel criteria for the development of monotonic and oscillatory instabilities in a two-layer film
Physics of Fluids 29, 092104 (2017); 10.1063/1.5001729

Dispersion-driven instability of mixed convective flow in porous media
Physics of Fluids 29, 094102 (2017); 10.1063/1.4990386

The rising motion of spheres in structured fluids with yield stress
Physics of Fluids 29, 093101 (2017); 10.1063/1.4998740

The propulsion of two flapping foils with tandem configuration and vortex interactions
Physics of Fluids 29, 097102 (2017); 10.1063/1.5001501
The effect of permeability on the flow past permeable disks at low Reynolds numbers

Cathal Cummins, Ignazio Maria Viola, and Naomi Nakayama

1 Institute for Energy Systems, School of Engineering, University of Edinburgh, EH9 3DW Edinburgh, United Kingdom
2 Institute of Molecular Plant Sciences, School of Biological Sciences, University of Edinburgh, EH9 3BF Edinburgh, United Kingdom
3 SynthSys Centre for Systems and Synthetic Biology, School of Biological Sciences, University of Edinburgh, EH9 3BF Edinburgh, United Kingdom
4 Institute for Integrated Micro and Nano Systems, Scottish Microelectronics Centre, School of Engineering, University of Edinburgh, EH9 3FF Edinburgh, United Kingdom
5 Centre for Science at Extreme Conditions, School of Biological Sciences, University of Edinburgh, EH9 3DF Edinburgh, United Kingdom

(Received 18 April 2017; accepted 21 August 2017; published online 18 September 2017)

The viscous flow over a thick permeable circular disk in the Reynolds number ($Re$) range of 10 to 130 and in the Darcy number ($Da$) range of $10^{-9}$ to 1 is examined. Direct numerical simulations are performed on a 2D grid with axisymmetric boundary conditions. Three flow regimes are observed: I, II, and III. In regime I (effectively impervious; $Da < 10^{-6}$), the wake is characterized by the presence of a toroidal vortex whose length is approximately equal to that of an impervious disk. In regime II (transition; $10^{-6} < Da < 10^{-3}$), the increase in $Da$ causes the vortex to shorten and move downstream and eventually vanishes at a critical Darcy number $Da_c$. Regime III ($Da > 10^{-3}$) is the highly permeable regime, in which there is no recirculation. In I, good agreement with existing experimental data for impervious disks is found. In III, an analytical expression for the drag force on the disk is derived, showing good agreement with the numerical results. A global upper limit of $Da_c = Da_{max}$ above which the disk is unable to maintain a recirculating wake for any $Re$ is identified. Finally, in regime II, it is demonstrated that increasing the permeability can lead to large variations in the length of the recirculating wake but with minimal effect on the drag coefficient even when $Da > Da_{max}$. This has important implications in our understanding of the locomotive strategies adopted by organisms that use porous bodies for movement. Published by AIP Publishing.

[http://dx.doi.org/10.1063/1.5001342]

I. INTRODUCTION

The fluid flow past and through a permeable body is an important problem in many physical applications such as binary alloy solidification, tissue engineering scaffolds in micro-bioreactors, sedimentation in liquid-solid reactors, and in the wind dispersal of small plants. For very low permeabilities, permeable bodies interact with the surrounding fluid as though they were impervious to it; hence, many of the results for impervious bodies hold for highly impermeable bodies. As a body’s permeability is increased, some interesting features emerge, which distinguish the flow around a permeable body from its impervious counterpart. Many studies have shown that the flow fields around permeable bodies undergo qualitative changes in their structure as the permeability is increased, such as transition from recirculation to shear flow. Over a large range of permeabilities, the drag force acting on a permeable body differs little from that of an equivalent impervious body. Some insects make use of this by evolving weight-saving porous wings rather than impervious wings. For example, the millimeter-sized insect wings of Thrips (Thysanoptera) are composed of filaments, which are 80 $\mu$m in length, 1 $\mu$m in diameter, and spaced 20 $\mu$m apart, leading to an overall wing porosity of 0.95. These wings supply 90% of the force produced by an impervious wing but weigh about 10% of such a wing. The drag force experienced by permeable bodies such as permeable spheres and permeable cylinders can also exceed that of an equivalent impervious body.

The flow around various permeable bodies has been examined in the past: including a 2D permeable square and circular cylinder and a permeable sphere. However, the case of low-Reynolds number ($Re$) flow past a permeable disk has yet to be considered. The only experiments of the flow past permeable circular disks were conducted using Particle Image Velocimetry (PIV) at high $Re$. This is surprising, since the literature on the fluid flow past impervious disks is extensive, and their motion is incredibly rich. In this paper, we aim to close this gap by examining the effect of finite permeability on the low-$Re$ fluid flow past permeable disks.
An impervious circular disk falling in a viscous fluid at low Reynolds numbers (based on the disk’s diameter) experiences one of five possible motions: 1

1. For \( Re \ll 1 \): the disk falls steadily maintaining its initial orientation.
2. For \( 1 \ll Re < 100 \): the disk falls steadily along its axis, maintains a horizontal orientation, and experiences a drag force identical to that of a fixed disk.
3. For \( Re > 100 \): the motion is generally unsteady and depends on the dimensionless moment of inertia \( I' \), which is defined as the ratio of disk’s moment of inertia about an axis in the plane of the disk and through its center to that of a rigid sphere of fluid of the same diameter. For small \( I' \), the disk shows small regular pitching oscillations about this axis, without any translational motion.
4. For \( Re > 100 \) and intermediate \( I' \): the disk shows a glide-tumble motion. The amplitude of the pitching motion defined above is no longer small and becomes chaotic, leading to appreciable translational motion of the disk’s center of mass in changing directions.
5. For \( Re > 100 \) and large \( I' \): the motion is one of continuous tumbling while drifting in one direction.

Once free fall motion becomes unsteady, the mean drag force acting on the disk can differ significantly from that on a fixed disk with steady relative velocity. Fabre, Auguste, and Magnaudet considered the generic problem of wake instabilities past fixed axisymmetric bodies, and they focus on the extreme cases of a sphere and a flat disk. Their numerical results reveal that the wakes of spheres and disks evolve differently as \( Re \) increases and that new vortex shedding modes are found to exist behind a disk, not present for spheres.

Shenoy and Kleinreuter consider the flow over a thick circular impervious disk of aspect ratio \( \chi = 10 \) (diameter/thickness) in the \( Re \) range of 10–300, using Computational Fluid Dynamics (CFD). They identified five flow regimes depending on the value of \( Re \); the three regimes corresponding to the lowest \( Re \) are as follows:

1. \( Re < 135 \): steady axisymmetric flow with the presence of a toroidal vortex behind the disk;
2. \( 135 \leq Re < 155 \): regular bifurcation with loss of azimuthal symmetry but with planar symmetry and a double-threaded wake;
3. \( 155 \leq Re < 172 \): three-dimensional flow with periodic shedding of double-sided hairpin-shaped vortex structures and periodic motion of the separation region.

Auguste, Fabre, and Magnaudet study the dynamics of the wake of an impervious circular disk of aspect ratio \( \chi = 3 \) embedded in a uniform flow, focusing in particular on the range \( 150 < Re < 218 \). As \( Re \) is increased, the flow experiences multiple bifurcations, ultimately resulting in a chaotic state.

The case of a permeable bluff body has generally received less attention. The first studies considered the creeping flow \( (Re \ll 1) \) past a permeable sphere, where the resistance experienced by permeable spheres in creeping flow was always less than that experienced by the equivalent impervious sphere. Feng and Michaelides obtained general expressions for the drag force acting on a permeable sphere at a small but finite \( Re \) and observed that this force is always less than the corresponding values of the equivalent impervious sphere. These observations are confirmed in experiments that examined the settling velocities of permeable spheres falling in creeping flow conditions and at small but finite \( Re \). As \( Re \) increases \( (7 < Re < 120) \), however, a permeable sphere actually experienced a higher drag than an equivalent impermeable sphere.

In the experimental studies of high-\( Re \) flow past perforated plates, a reversed flow bubble is observed behind the plate, which detaches and moves downstream. There are two distinct regimes of the flow: one appropriate to low values of porosity where the vortex street dominates the wake; the strength of this vortex street gradually decreases as the vorticity in the shear layers decreases with the introduction of bleed air, and the reversed flow region and vortex formation region move downstream. In the other flow regime, corresponding to high porosity, the vortex street is not present at all, and the transition between these two regimes is abrupt.

Noymer, Glicksman, and Devendra considered the case of a permeable circular cylinder at low-to-moderate \( Re \) \( (10 < Re < 1000) \) using a numerical model based on an application of Darcy’s law to the region occupied by the cylinder. Consistent with previous studies, the drag force acting on the permeable cylinder can be higher than that of an impermeable cylinder, and these findings were substantiated by wind tunnel measurements on permeable cylinders. There is an emerging literature on the study of the flow past arrays, or patches, of obstacles. Interestingly, the drag coefficient measured for sparse arrays is found to increase with decreasing permeability, reaching a maximum for some finite permeability. This maximum is higher than that found for an equivalent impervious obstacle, in agreement with experiments on permeable spheres and permeable cylinders.

Jue considered the vortex shedding behind a permeable square cylinder using a numerical model based on the Darcy-Brinkman equations for \( Re = O (10^2) \). The flow fields and characteristic values of vortex shedding for Darcy numbers \( Da \) approaching zero \( (Da \leq 10^{-6}) \) are almost entirely unchanged from that of an impervious square cylinder. A larger \( Da \) was found to postpone the occurrence of flow fluctuations. Later, a similar numerical model was used to demonstrate that an increase in \( Da \) delays the critical \( Re \) at which vortex shedding phenomena occur for permeable square cylinders.

More recently, the steady flow around and through a permeable circular cylinder was studied numerically using the Darcy-Brinkman-Forchheimer equations. The recirculating wake existing downstream of the cylinder is found to either penetrate into or be completely detached from the cylinder; the problem is explored in the \( Re-Da \) parameter space. Also presented in the study is the variation of the critical Reynolds number for the onset of a recirculating wake as a function of \( Da \).

To date, the flow past a permeable circular disk at moderate \( Re \) has yet to be examined. One particularly interesting feature of all permeable bodies is that at some critical Darcy number, the wake disappears. However, this absolute upper limit on permeability has never been computed for a
permeable body. Furthermore, in all previous studies of permeable bodies, the recirculating wake has always been examined independently from the drag forces experienced by the body. By examining the wake structure and the drag forces together, any regions of the parameter space where these two quantities are decoupled in their dependence on the permeability can be identified. This is an important concept in biology, where the biological function of a permeable body changes as the body’s permeability changes. In some organisms, for example, the function of the recirculating wake may be for food capture; other organisms, such as small flying insects, have evolved highly porous wings, which weigh much less than an impervious wing but with little loss in aerodynamic function.

The objective of the present study is to characterize the steady flow past a permeable circular disk. We will examine the low-Re flow past a permeable disk for a range of permeabilities (characterized by the disk’s Darcy number). Three regimes are identified: (I) an effectively impervious regime, (II) a transition regime, and (III) a highly permeable regime. In regime I, the flow quantities approach that of an impervious disk, showing good agreement with existing experimental data; in regime III, the flow is shown to approach a high-permeability limit, within which an asymptotic formulation of the resistance experienced by the disk is derived. The solution in regime II does not yield to an asymptotic analysis and must be explored by solving the original equations numerically, and we show that our results are consistent with previous studies on permeable bodies.

The paper is structured as follows: in Sec. II, the governing equations are written down and non-dimensionalized (Sec. II A), and the numerical procedure and a summary of the uncertainty analysis are presented (Sec. II B). We provide the full details of our uncertainty analysis in Appendix A, including a verification (Appendix A 1) and validation (Appendix A 2) study. The results are presented in Sec. III and discussed in Sec. IV. The paper concludes with a further discussion in Sec. V of the results obtained with reference to existing studies on the flow past permeable bodies.

II. MATHEMATICAL MODEL

A. The governing equations

Consider a permeable circular disk with diameter $D'$, thickness $T'$, isotropic porosity $\epsilon$, and permeability $\kappa'$ moving along its axis in a viscous fluid with a characteristic velocity of magnitude $U'$, where the primes indicate a quantity with a physical dimension. For an incompressible Newtonian fluid with density $\rho'$ and dynamic viscosity $\mu'$, the flow satisfies the steady-state Navier-Stokes equations,

$$
\rho' \left( \frac{1}{\epsilon^2} \mathbf{u}' \cdot \nabla \right) \mathbf{u}' = -\nabla' p' + \frac{\mu'}{\epsilon} \nabla'^2 \mathbf{u}',
$$

in the fluid domain, where the fluid’s velocity $\mathbf{u}'(x')$ is given by $\mathbf{u}' = u'_r \hat{r} + u'_z \hat{z}$, where $p'(x')$ is the pressure, $\hat{r}$ and $\hat{z}$ are the unit vectors as shown in Fig. 1(a), and $u'_r$ and $u'_z$ are the velocities in the $r$- and $z$-direction, respectively. The losses in momentum due to the porous medium are incorporated using the Brinkman equations,

$$
\rho' \left( \frac{1}{\epsilon^2} \mathbf{u}' \cdot \nabla \right) \mathbf{u}' = -\nabla' p' + \frac{\mu'}{\epsilon} \nabla'^2 \mathbf{u}' - \frac{\mu'}{\kappa'} \mathbf{u}',
$$

and the continuity equation $\nabla' \cdot \mathbf{u}' = 0$ in the porous region. At the interface between the porous region and the fluid domain, continuity of $\mathbf{u}'$ and $p'$ is imposed.

Let us introduce the following non-dimensional variables:

$$
\mathbf{u} = \mathbf{u}'/U', \quad p = p'/(\rho' U'^2), \quad x = x'/D',
$$

then $\mathbf{u}$ satisfies

$$
(\mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla) \mathbf{u} = -\nabla p + \frac{1}{Re} \nabla^2 \mathbf{u},
$$

in the fluid domain, and

$$
\left( \frac{1}{\epsilon^2} \mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla \right) \mathbf{u} = -\nabla p + \frac{1}{\epsilon Re} \nabla^2 \mathbf{u} - \frac{1}{Da Re} \mathbf{u},
$$

in the porous region, where

$$
Re = \frac{U' \rho' D'}{\mu'}, \quad Da = \frac{\kappa'}{D'^2}
$$

are the Reynolds number and Darcy number, respectively. The non-dimensional continuity equation,

$$
\nabla \cdot \mathbf{u} = 0,
$$

is satisfied throughout the domain. There are four model parameters: $Re$, $Da$, $\epsilon$, and the aspect ratio $\chi = D'/T'$. In this study, $\epsilon$ is fixed to be 0.95 and $\chi$ is fixed at 10.

B. The numerical model

1. Computational domain and grid

The numerical solution to the steady incompressible Navier–Stokes and Brinkman equations, Eqs. (4),(5), and (7), along with their boundary conditions, was computed using the finite-element-based commercial code COMSOL Multiphysics. The half section of the permeable circular disk of diameter $D$ and aspect ratio $\chi = 10$ was modeled by a rectangular box $(0.5D \times 0.1D)$ in a 2D-axisymmetric computational domain, Fig. 1(a). The reference system of coordinates $(r, z)$, whose origin is located in the center of the disk, with the $z$-axis points in the direction of the freestream velocity, and the $r$-axis lies along the width of the disk. The domain extends 6$D$ radially, 15$D$ downstream, and 2.5$D$ upstream of the disk [see Fig. 1(b)]. Uniform velocity is prescribed at the upstream face of the domain, and slip on the face at $r = 6D$. An axisymmetric symmetry condition was used at $r = 0$ and a constant pressure was imposed at the downstream face. Figure 1(b) shows the H-type grid with 384 and 2016 cells in the radial and streamwise directions, respectively, and the mesh grading near the disk’s surface [inset, Fig. 1(b)].

2. Uncertainty and error analysis

Here, the findings of the uncertainty and error analysis are summarized, while full details are provided in Appendix A. To facilitate this study, the uncertainty and error of two quantities are considered: the wake length $L$ and the drag coefficient $C_D$. At the minimum and maximum Reynolds numbers considered
in this study: $Re = 10$ and $Re = 130$. For these two $Re$, the differences between $C_D$ computed with the reference grid and by halving the number of grid points both streamwise and radially are 0.47% and 0.15% for $Re = 10$ and $Re = 130$, respectively. The differences between $L$ computed with these two grids are 0.14% and 0.02% for $Re = 10$ and $Re = 130$, respectively. These small differences indicate little dependence of the solution on the grid.

The numerical uncertainty is computed taking into account the grid resolution and the iterative error, while the error due to the numerical model considers the effects due to the choice of finite domain. The simulations were run in double precision and for a number of iterations sufficient to have an iterative convergence error that is several orders of magnitude smaller than all other numerical errors (see Appendix A for more details).

The numerical uncertainty $U_{num}$ at a 95% confidence level in both quantities is always less than 1% on the grid used in our study. The uncertainty in $C_D$ is 0.56% for $Re = 10$ and for $Re = 130$ it is 0.20%. The uncertainty $U_{num}$ in the wake length $L$ is 0.13% and 0.22% for $Re = 10$ and $Re = 130$, respectively. We compare our results to experimental data\textsuperscript{15} in Appendix A 2 for the case of an impervious disk. We demonstrate that our results are validated for $Re = 130$ and that at low $Re$, the choice in finite domain size accounts for the small differences between our computed values and the experimental measurements.

### III. THE RESULTS

In the Reynolds number range of 10–130, the flow is separated from the leading edge and forms a toroidal vortex behind the disk when $Da$ approaches zero, but this vortex disappears as $Da$ is increased past a critical Darcy number $Da_c$, which depends on $Re$. The vorticity increases with $Re$, as does the length of the recirculating wake (see Figs. 2 and 3). Going from (a) to (d) in Figs. 2 and 3, less vorticity is generated as $Da$ increases from low to high permeability, until a point where there is no recirculation at all.

In order to examine the evolution of the recirculating wake, the position of the stagnation points ($z_s$) in the flow must be determined. Once the upstream $z_u$ and the downstream stagnation points $z_d$ are found, the wake length is given by $L = z_d - z_u$. To determine the values of the stagnation points, the axial velocity in the streamwise direction ($u_z$) is computed; the vortex is present wherever $u_z < 0$.

Qualitatively, there are three cases:

1. For $Da < Da_c$, there are two stagnation points;
2. for $Da > Da_c$, there are no stagnation points, and hence, there is no recirculating vortex;
3. for $Da = Da_c$, the recirculating wake has zero length, and the distance downstream of the disk’s rear face at which the two stagnation points annihilate one another is denoted by $d = z_s - 1/(2\lambda)$.

The position of the stagnation points in the disk’s wake is plotted as a function of $Da$ in Fig. 4(a), for three values of the Reynolds number: $Re = 10$, 30, and 130. Three regimes are identified as follows:

1. An effectively impervious regime, $0 < Da < 10^{-6}$, where the upstream stagnation point ($z_u$) is on the disk’s rear face and the downstream stagnation point ($z_d$) is within 1% of that of a corresponding impervious disk.
2. A transition regime, $10^{-6} < Da < 10^{-3}$, where $z_u$ moves downstream towards $z_d$ as $Da$ is increased and $z_d$ generally moves upstream as $Da$ is increased.
3. A highly permeable regime, $Da > 10^{-3}$, where no stagnation points occur.

As $Da$ is increased within the transition regime, the downstream stagnation point generally moves towards the upstream stagnation point; however, it does not follow a monotonic path as $Da$ is increased, and it depends on the value of $Re$. Consider the $Re = 130$ curve in Fig. 4(a); increasing $Da$ in the transition regime, $z_d$ initially moves downstream [upwards in Fig. 4(a)] and then rapidly moves upstream [downwards in Fig. 4(a)] to meet the other stagnation point in a bifurcation at $Da = Da_c$. At the other three Reynolds numbers, the trend is monotonic: both stagnation points in each case move towards each other.
as $Da$ is increased, annihilating each other at $Da = Da_c$. The position of this bifurcation is examined in detail in Fig. 4(b), where $Da_c$ is plotted against the corresponding $Re$. The critical Darcy number $Da_c$ is not monotonically increasing in $Re$; it increases rapidly for low $Re$ and reaches a global maximum $Da_{max} = 8.8 \times 10^{-4}$ for $Re = 44.4$ (indicated by a $\times$ at the turning point). Hence, $Da_{max}$ represents the maximum $Da$ a permeable disk can have, across all $Re$ considered here, to maintain a recirculating vortex. For $Re > 44.4$, $Da_c$ decreases uniformly as the highest $Re = 130$ is reached. The highly permeable regime occupies $Da \geq 10^{-3}$, which ensures that no wake is possible (i.e., $Da > Da_{max}$). The boundary between the wake and no wake regimes is given by the following equation:

$$Da_c(Re) = Da_{max} \exp \left[ -c_1 \log^2 \left( \frac{Re}{Re_{max}} \right) \right] \times \cdots$$

$$\times \exp \left[ c_2 \left( \left( \frac{Re}{Re_{max}} \right)^2 - 2 \log(Re/Re_{max}) - 1 \right) \right],$$

(8)

where $Da_{max} = 8.8 \times 10^{-4}$, $Re_{max} = 44.4$, and the best fit coefficients $c_{1,2}$ (and 95% confidence interval bounds) are $c_1 = 0.612 \pm 0.023$, $c_2 = 0.044 \pm 0.006$.

The collapse of the recirculating wake as $Da$ approaches $Da_c$ is shown in Figs. 5(a) and 5(b). Figure 5(b) shows that for fixed $Da$ and fixed $Re$, there is precisely one possible wake length $L$ and that for a given $Da$, there are precisely two, one or zero critical Darcy numbers in the range $10 < Re < 130$. The wake length $L$ for $Da = 10^{-3}$ is indistinguishable from that of an impervious disk except near $Re = 130$ [which is indicated by the dashed curve in Fig. 5(b)]. Figure 5(a) shows the rapid collapse of the recirculating wake as $Da$ approaches $Da_c$ from below. The distance $d = z_s - 1/(2\chi)$ downstream of the disk’s downstream face where the recirculating wake first appears at $Da = Da_c$ is observed to increase with $Re$ as follows: $d \propto Re^{0.89}$ in the range $10 < Re < 130$.

Away from $Da_c$, for $Da$ approaching zero, the wake length approaches that of an impervious disk, so an effectively impervious regime exists corresponding to $Da$ below which the wake length differs from its impervious disk counterpart by less than 1%; the value of $Da$ that this occurs at for each of the curves is indicated by a solid black diamond in Fig. 4(a). To ensure that this is maintained across all $Re$ considered in this study, the effectively impervious regime occupies $Da < 10^{-6}$.

In the case of high-permeability (i.e., $Da$ tends to unity), the fluid moves through the permeable disk without appreciable deflection, and the drag coefficient of the permeable disk takes the following form (see Appendix B for details):

$$C_D = \frac{2}{\chi Da Re}.$$
The drag coefficient \( C_D \) is plotted in Fig. 6(a) as a function of \( Da \) for four Reynolds numbers: \( Re = 10, 30, 44.4, \) and 130. Each curve is characterized by a local maximum in regime II and a high-permeability limit given by Eq. (9). The computed axial drag coefficient is compared with experimental data\(^{15}\) for \( Re = 10–130 \) in Fig. 6(b).

Up to now, the dependence of \( C_D \) and \( L \) on \( Da \) and \( Re \) has been considered independently. Each quantity evolves in a qualitatively different manner as the parameters \( Re \) and \( Da \) are varied. The relative dependence of \( C_D \) and \( L \) on \( Da \) is now examined in order to explore if there are regions of the parameter space that are sensitive to one parameter but not the other. To do this, we select \( Re = 130 \), since at this value of \( Re \), the peak in the drag coefficient differs most from its impervious-disk counterpart. This relative increase/decrease of both quantities is compared to that of an impervious disk over the entire range of \( Da \) considered in this paper. The ratio of \( C_D \) for a permeable disk to that of an impervious (solid) disk \( C_{D,s} \) is shown in Fig. 7(a), and on the same graph, the ratio of the wake length \( L \) to that of an impervious disk \( L_s \) is also shown. Evidently, the wake length begins to fall off at a smaller \( Da \) than does \( C_D \). At the boundary between regimes II and III, where the wake has disappeared, the drag coefficient is still about 70% of its impervious-disk value. In Fig. 7(b), we show that, at \( Da = Da_c \), where there is no reverse flow, the drag coefficient differs from its impervious disk value by less than 5%. This indicates that the wake length can undergo large deviations from that of an impervious disk but that the drag is changed little at the same level of permeability. Hence, within regime II, there is scope to increase the permeability of the disk, resulting in a large decrease in the length or complete annihilation of the wake but with minimal effect on the drag.

IV. DISCUSSION

To date, to the authors’ knowledge, the only study on the flow past permeable disks\(^{13}\) is for \( Re = 10^4 \), and this prevents a quantitative comparison of our results to theirs from being carried out. However, we expect that the underlying physics in both cases is similar at both \( Re \). To compare our results to theirs, we plot the pressure \( p \) and streamwise velocity \( u_z \) along the \( r = 0 \) axis at the highest \( Re \) considered in our study (\( Re = 130 \)) in Fig. 8. We perform this for three values of \( Da \), corresponding to regimes I, II, and II.

In regime I, the accumulation of vorticity due to the presence of the disk causes vortex formation directly behind the disk, as shown in Figs. 2(a) and 3(a). This picture is consistent with existing experiments on impervious disks; in Fig. 8(b), we show data from experiments\(^{13}\) on impervious (×) and permeable (+) disks performed at \( Re = 10^4 \) alongside our results at \( Re = 130 \).
FIG. 4. (a) The position of the stagnation points ($z_s$) in the wake of a permeable disk as a function of $Da$; the circled numbers indicate $Re$ of the flow. The bifurcation point, corresponding to the collapse of the wake, is indicated by the small annulus. The black diamonds indicate the point at which the difference between the wake length $L$ and $L_s$ is less than 1%. Each mark shows the computed value, and the solid line indicates the linear fit of these values. (b) The bifurcation diagram in the $Re$-$Da$ plane (each point on the curve denotes the value of $Da_c$ at the given $Re$) with the turning point at ($Da_{max} = 8.8 \times 10^{-4}$, 44.4) indicated by an $\times$.

The case of a permeable disk in regime II is different: the region of recirculating flow is not directly downstream of the disk as shown in Figs. 2(b) and 3(b), but is separated some distance downstream of the disk. Comparing Figs. 3(a)–3(c), the vortex is both smaller in width and length; the latter is established precisely in Fig. 4(a) in good agreement with experiments on permeable plates.\(^{22}\) In addition, the maximum reverse flow speed along the $r = 0$ axis is smaller for a permeable disk than it is for an impervious one, as shown in Fig. 8(b), in good agreement with experiments\(^{13}\) on impervious disks.

FIG. 5. (a) The wake length ($L$) behind a permeable disk as a function of $Da$; the circled numbers indicate $Re$ of the flow. (b) The collapse of the wake as $Da \to Da_{max} = 8.8 \times 10^{-4}$ and $Re \to 44.4$ (indicated by an $\times$); the boxed numbers indicate $Da$ of the disk.
FIG. 6. The drag coefficient $C_D$ for a permeable disk: (a) as a function of $Da$, with circled numbers indicating $Re$ of the flow, and (b) as a function of $Re$ with circled numbers indicating $Da$ of the disk. The black squares are experimental\textsuperscript{15} data points for the drag coefficient of an impervious disk. The high-permeability approximations are indicated by the $\cdash$ curves, which are given by Eq. (9).

We find that disks in regime I have larger maximum reverse flows along the $r = 0$ axis than those in regime II and that the rate of velocity recovery for disks in regime I is faster than disks in regime II/III, as shown in Fig. 8(b). Due to the fluid bleed through the disk in regime II, the entrainment...
of the shear layer is significantly reduced and the position of the downstream stagnation point \( z_{sd} \) increases. These observations are consistent with experimental measurements,\(^{13}\) which are shown alongside our results in Fig. 8(b). These experiments show that the position of the downstream stagnation point is further downstream than the stagnation point of the wake behind an equivalent impervious disk, in excellent agreement with our findings in Fig. 4(a), which show a maximal downstream excursion of the downstream stagnation point at intermediate \( Da \) for the highest \( Re \) considered. The transverse velocity profiles of the wake region are presented in Fig. 9. In Fig. 9(b), we have plotted the experimental\(^{13}\) measurements of \( u_z \) along the radial direction at a distance of one disk diameter downstream of the disk’s rear face at \( Re = 10^4 \). In our simulations and in experiment, the maximum reverse flow along the axis and the velocity recovery are shown to decrease with increasing \( Da \).

We also remark that our velocity profiles are in good agreement with the experiments on the flow around permeable plates.\(^{22}\) Consistent with our results, a reversed flow bubble detaches and moves downstream. The downstream stagnation point undergoes a maximal excursion from the plate, in
agreement with our results in Fig. 4(a). The experiments show that there are two flow regimes, one corresponding to high permeability and one to low permeability, and that the transition between the two flow regimes is quite sudden. This is in good agreement with our findings: we have two distinct regimes corresponding to low and high values of permeability (regimes I and III), whereas the abrupt changes in wake topology behind a permeable plate correspond to the bifurcation points in regime II, which show rapid destruction of the wake.

The presence of the global maximum in $C_D$ in Fig. 6(a) has been found in previous experimental and numerical studies, but what causes this increase remains unclear. To understand what causes this increase, consider the case of a highly permeable disk (far to the right of regime III); in this case, the velocity is constant and axial, the pressure field is antisymmetric across the disk, and according to Eq. (9), $C_D$ increases inversely with $Da$. However, this trend cannot continue indefinitely as $Da$ approaches 0; as we approach regime II from the right, the assumption of $\frac{\partial p}{\partial z} = 0$ breaks down, and Eq. (9) is no longer valid. In fact, the pressure behind the disk is lower than it is in the far field due to the pressure loss across the permeable disk. While, far downstream, the pressure must have risen to the level of the freestream pressure. Decreasing $Da$ within regime III causes the axial velocity $u_c$ at some point located a short distance downstream of the disk to decrease in the streamwise direction driven by the positive pressure gradient there [as can be seen in Fig. 8(b)]. Within regime III, the viscous contribution to the $z$-component of Eq. (4) is negligible, and along the disk’s axis, we have a balance of the pressure gradient and the inertial terms,

$$\frac{\partial p}{\partial z} = -u_c \frac{\partial u_c}{\partial z}, \quad (10)$$

which, when integrated with respect to $z$, gives the Bernoulli equation. Note that the right-hand side of Eq. (10), by the above reasoning, must be positive. This inviscid effect can only dampen the increase of $\Delta p$ across the disk and thus the increase of $C_D$ with decreasing $Da$; it cannot reverse the trend, and this effect cannot account for reversal of the flow.

However, as the steepness of the velocity gradients overcomes the smallness of $1/Re$ in Eq. (4), this picture begins to break down and Eq. (10) is no longer valid. Instead, we can no longer neglect the influence of viscosity in the wake region, and we must include the viscous contribution. Hence, along the disk’s axis, $u_c$ and $p$ satisfy

$${\frac{\partial p}{\partial z} = -u_c \frac{\partial u_c}{\partial z} + \frac{1}{Re} \left\{ \frac{\partial^2 u_c}{\partial r^2} + \frac{\partial^2 u_c}{\partial z^2} \right\}. \quad (11)$$

Observe that the inertial term on the right-hand side of Eq. (11) is non-negative as shown above but that the viscous term must be negative near to the disk, as shown in Figs. 9(a) and 8(b).

Hence, as the velocity gradient increases with $Da$, eventually the viscous effects balance the inertial effects, and the right-hand side of Eq. (11) vanishes. As the gradients become steeper still, the viscous effects dominate, and the pressure gradient becomes negative, according to Eq. (11). This transition from positive to negative pressure gradient as we move from regime III through regime II to regime I is shown in Fig. 8(a) for $Re = 130$.

This effect is restricted to the wake region, whereas the sign of the pressure gradient on the disk’s front is positive throughout this process. The pressure experiences a slower rate of increase on the rear face compared with the front face as $Da$ is decreased [as shown in Fig. 8(a)] reflecting the competition between the viscous effects and the inertial effects in the wake. This widening of $\Delta p$ leads to a local maximum in the value of $C_D$, before gradually approaching that of an impervious disk as $Da \to 0$. At high permeabilities, the pressure gradient is balanced by inertial effects, whereas at low permeabilities, the pressure gradient is balanced by viscous effects. Hence, one may consider another classification for the boundary between regimes I and II which is based on the sign/magnitude of the pressure gradient and inertial terms in Eq. (11), on the disk’s rear face.

Within a narrow interval of $Da$, $C_D$ does not change appreciably, yet the wake length $L$ drops rapidly from its maximum value to zero [Figs. 7(b) and 8(a)]. For an impervious and permeable disk of the same physical dimensions, the recirculating region behind the latter can be reduced or eliminated choosing different values of $Da$. This resembles a base bleed effect and suggests that $Da$ can be used as a flow control parameter in the movement of permeable disks through a viscous fluid.

At higher $Re$ than considered here, it can be speculated that this flow control mechanism could be useful to control or suppress the vortex shedding behind impervious bodies. This would have important implications for the dynamics of freely falling impervious disks. Perhaps a disk’s permeability can be tuned to control the dynamics of the disks. Furthermore, this control may not come at the expense of a significant loss in the disk’s $C_D$; in fact, it may lead to an increase in $C_D$. This is of particular relevance in the design of drag-enhancing
parachutes, which aim to optimize drag and control at the same time.

We have considered the case of a permeable disk, and we find that there is a curve in the $Re-Da$ parameter space that divides the regime where the disk has a recirculating wake from the regime where the disk does not have one. Similar curves have been found for different geometries, such as the 2D square cylinder,\(^6\) 2D circular cylinder,\(^7\) and a sphere.\(^8\) We present our results for the permeable disk alongside the results for other geometries in Fig. 10. We note that previous studies on square and circular cylinders were restricted to a smaller range of $Re$, within which no turning point in the $Re-Da$ space was observed. One study, for the permeable sphere,\(^8\) however, considered a wider range of $Re$ and indeed observed a turning point. Interestingly, this turning point occurs at a $Re$ close to that for a disk.

V. CONCLUSIONS

We have examined the viscous flow over a permeable circular disk of aspect ratio $\chi = 10$ in the Reynolds number ($Re$) range of $10–130$ and in the Darcy number ($Da$) range of $10^{-6}$ to $1$. We observed three flow regimes: (I) an effectively impervious regime existed when $Da < 10^{-6}$, characterized by the presence of a toroidal vortex located a very short distance downstream of the disk; (II) a transition regime when $10^{-6} < Da < 10^{-3}$ where the lower vorticity production weakens the vortex in regime I, causing the toroidal vortex to shorten and move downstream, eventually vanishing completely; (III) a highly permeable regime, in which there is no recirculating wake.

We have calculated the limiting permeability of a permeable disk $Da_{max}$ above which no recirculation can occur [regime III; Figs. 5(a) and 5(b)]. The presence of such an upper limit is consistent with the results for other bodies,\(^6–8\) but the upper limit has never been computed in any of these studies. For $Da$ greater than this limiting permeability, we show that the drag coefficient, $C_D$, depends on $Re$, $Da$, and $\chi$ and asymptotically approaches zero as permeability increases, consistent with the tendency of permeable spheres and cylinders.\(^4,21\)

In regime II, the drag coefficient is characterized by a local maximum close to the boundary between regime II and regime III [Fig. 6(a)], which is consistent with the experimental results for permeable spheres, cylinders, and other permeable bodies.\(^3,4,11\) The peak in $C_D$ occurs at higher $Da$ for decreasing $Re$, and the peak value significantly exceeds the drag on an impervious disk of the same dimensions $C_{D_{imp}}$ for moderate values of $Re$. This finding is consistent with the numerical simulations and experiments on the flow past permeable cylinders,\(^4\) where increases were found for moderate-$Re$ flow past a permeable cylinder compared with an impervious one.

The wake length $L$ tends asymptotically to its impervious-disk counterpart $L_{imp}$ as $Da$ is decreased to zero: in regime I, $L$ is within 1% of its impervious-disk value (Fig. 5). In regime II, we find that both stagnation points generally move downstream as the wake shortens, with the downstream stagnation point uniformly decreasing from its impervious-disk value, before rapidly approaching the upstream stagnation point as $Da \rightarrow Da_{c}$ [Fig. 4(a)]. We also find that for higher $Re$ ($Re = 130$, for example), the downstream stagnation point undergoes a small downstream excursion characterized by a local maximum in its position close to the boundary between regime II and III, which is consistent with experiments on permeable disks and plates.\(^1,3,22\)

We compare the relative dependence of $C_D$ and $L$ on $Da$ [Fig. 7(a)], showing that the wake length can undergo large deviations from its impervious-disk value, but with minimal change in the drag coefficient over the same range. This suggests that permeability could be used as an effective flow control mechanism in the motion of permeable bodies. The wake behind an impervious disk at $Re$ considered in this study, $10 < Re < 130$, is steady; at higher $Re$, the flow past impervious disks is generally unsteady with a loss in symmetry. Hence, to explore higher $Re$, the assumptions of axisymmetry and steady-state in the current model must be relaxed—this is left as future work.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This work was supported by the Leverhulme Trust (No. RPG-2015-255).

APPENDIX A: UNCERTAINTY ANALYSIS

We performed the verification and validation of $L$ and $C_D$ computed with COMSOL Multiphysics. We considered the case of a permeable disk with very low permeability ($Da = 10^{-25}$) and an impervious disk for the minimum ($Re = 10$) and maximum ($Re = 130$) Reynolds numbers examined in the paper, for which some experimental data are available in the literature.

1. Verification

The numerical uncertainty $U_{num}$ is quantified using the method proposed by Viola, Bot, and Rioult.\(^31\) This method was initially developed for yacht sail aerodynamics, but it can be applied to any other application. The method is as follows: the 95% confidence interval of any computed value $\phi_{num}$ (in this paper, $\phi_{num}$ is either $L$ or $C_D$) is given by $\phi_{num} \pm U_{num} \phi_{num}$, where the numerical uncertainty $U_{num}$ is the sum of the uncertainties due to the grid ($U_g$) and the iterative convergence ($U_c$),

$$U_{num} = U_g + U_c.$$ 

To compute $U_g$, simulations with $n_{grid} = 6$ different grid sizes ($N$ cells in the radial direction and $M$ cells in the axial direction) were performed. The grid sizes ($N \times M$) of grids 1-6 are shown in the second column of Table I. The reference grid, for which the uncertainty is computed, can be either uniformly refined or uniformly coarsened using a structured refinement strategy. We define the relative step size $h_i$ as the ratio of the cell sizes of the $i$th grid to that of the reference grid (our reference grid is always grid 6, and $h_{i+1} = h_i / \sqrt{2}$) and $\phi_i$ as the ratio of the quantity (either $L$ or $C_D$) computed with the $i$th grid to that computed with the reference grid.

As $h$ approaches zero, the fit of $\phi_i$ should converge to $\phi = \phi_0$ with the order $p$ of the adopted numerical scheme. Given that different schemes are used to solve the coupled
TABLE I. The uncertainty in the numerical method due to the grid ($U_{\text{num}}$; expressed as a percentage of $\phi_{\text{num}}$) for the drag coefficient $C_D$ and the length of the wake $L$ for a highly impermeable disk ($Da = 1 \times 10^{-25}$).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grid</th>
<th>$N \times M$</th>
<th>$U_{C_D}$ (%)</th>
<th>$U_L$ (%)</th>
<th>$U_{C_D}$ (%)</th>
<th>$U_L$ (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>68 $\times$ 357</td>
<td>2.94</td>
<td>1.22</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>0.21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>96 $\times$ 504</td>
<td>2.18</td>
<td>0.78</td>
<td>0.65</td>
<td>0.26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>136 $\times$ 714</td>
<td>1.59</td>
<td>0.49</td>
<td>0.51</td>
<td>0.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>192 $\times$ 1008</td>
<td>1.15</td>
<td>0.30</td>
<td>0.39</td>
<td>0.24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>272 $\times$ 1428</td>
<td>0.81</td>
<td>0.19</td>
<td>0.28</td>
<td>0.23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>384 $\times$ 2016</td>
<td>0.56</td>
<td>0.13</td>
<td>0.20</td>
<td>0.22</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

system of equations, $p$ is generally unknown. Therefore, a curve,

$$\phi(h) = \phi_0 + \alpha h^p,$$

is fitted through the set of $\phi_i$. The parameters $\{\phi_0, \alpha, p\}$ can be estimated by a least squares method. We also compute the standard error of the fit,

$$\sigma_{\text{fit}} = \sqrt{\frac{\sum_{i=1}^{n_g} (\phi_i - \phi(h_i))^2}{n}},$$

where $\phi(h_i)$ is the value of the function $\phi$ evaluated at $h_i$ and $n = n_g - 3$ is the number of degrees of freedom of the fit. The extrapolated value $\phi_0$ is the expected value of $\phi$ for an infinitely fine grid. This allows estimating the error of the reference grid as

$$\delta = |1 - \phi_0|,$$

hence the grid uncertainty is then given by

$$U_g = 1.25\delta + \sigma_{\text{fit}},$$

where 1.25 is a safety factor. In all of our computations, the iterative error on the value of $C_D$ is specified by the solver’s relative tolerance, which was set to $10^{-9}$ in all computations; since this is several orders of magnitude smaller than $U_g$, we neglect it for both $C_D$ and $L$. The results from our uncertainty analysis for the numerical error are presented in Table I, where $U_{C_D}$ and $U_L$ are the uncertainties due to the numerical method for $C_D$ and $L$, respectively. The results presented in Sec. III are obtained from simulations performed on grid 6; hence, we find that $U_{\text{num}} < 1\%$ in value for $C_D$ and $L$ at the lowest and highest $Re$ considered in this study.

The small numerical uncertainties $U_{\text{num}}$ in Table I give us confidence in the presented trends of $C_D$ and $L$ with $Re$ and $Da$. In order to validate the solution, however, we must compare with experimental measurements of $C_D$ and $L$. To the authors’ knowledge, however, there are no experimental measurements of $C_D$ or $L$ for permeable disks in the literature; hence, we seek to validate our model by considering the drag coefficient and wake of an impervious disk; denoted as $C_{D,s}$ and $L_s$, respectively. We begin by computing $U_{\text{num}}$ in $C_{D,s}$ and $L_s$ for grids 1-6 as we did in Table I; our results are presented in Table II. We find that $U_{\text{num}}$ in $C_{D,s}$ and $L_s$ is the same order of magnitude as for a permeable disk.

2. Validation

For validation purposes, we use the experimental data for an impervious disk. We consider the uncertainty in the drag coefficient $C_{D,s}$. The first two rows in Table III show the computed value $\phi_{\text{num}}$ and the associated numerical uncertainty $U_{\text{num}}$, taken from the last row of Table II. The second and third rows are the measured values $\phi_{\exp}$ at $Re = 10$ and $Re = 130$, which are obtained using a best-fit curve through the experimental measurements. The uncertainty due to the experimental measurements was not presented in Ref. 15, hence we estimate $U_{\exp}$ to be the 95% confidence interval of the mean of the technical repeats conducted nearest $Re = 10$ and $Re = 130$ in Ref. 15, respectively. The fifth row in Table III shows the validation uncertainty $U_{\text{val}} = \sqrt{U_{\text{num}}^2 + U_{\exp}^2}$ and the sixth row shows the error $\mathcal{E} = \phi_{\text{num}} - \phi_{\exp}$ in the estimate of the drag coefficient.

Our analysis reveals that our numerical simulations over-predict $C_{D,s}$ by 5.85% and 2.56% for $Re = 10$ and $Re = 130$, respectively, compared with experiment. In the latter case ($Re = 130$), $|\mathcal{E}| < U_{\text{val}}$, and hence our results are validated at a level of 4.31% for $Re = 130$. However, in the former case ($Re = 10$), $|\mathcal{E}| > U_{\text{val}}$, so our simulations are not validated for $Re = 10$. Since $\mathcal{E} > 0$, the associated modeling error for the drag coefficient $\delta_{\text{mod}} = 0.05$ is also positive.

To find the main source of this modeling error, we compute the error introduced by choosing a finite domain size. In order to calculate this error, we select $n_{\text{mod}} = 4$ domains sizes: A-D with radial extent $W$ and axial extent $H$ (as shown

![Table II](image)

$^a$The grids used for the impervious disk computations are identical to those used for the permeable disk, except that the permeable region is absent.

![Table III](image)

$^b$The grids used for the permeable disk computations are identical to those used for the impervious disk, except that the permeable region is absent.
TABLE IV. The modeling error $\delta_{\text{mod}}$ in the mathematical model due to the finite-sized domain for the drag coefficient $C_{D,i}$ and the length of the wake $L_i$ for an impervious disk. The values for the width $W$ and height $H$ refer to the radial and axial extent of the domain in disk diameters, respectively. All computations are performed on grid 6: see Table I.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Domain</th>
<th>$W \times H$</th>
<th>$\delta_{\text{mod},C_{D,i}}$ (%)</th>
<th>$\delta_{\text{mod},L_i}$ (%)</th>
<th>$\delta_{\text{mod},C_{D,i}}$ (%)</th>
<th>$\delta_{\text{mod},L_i}$ (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>4.2 x 12.4</td>
<td>+4.92</td>
<td>+0.16</td>
<td>+0.68</td>
<td>-0.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>6.0 x 17.5</td>
<td>+3.82</td>
<td>+0.07</td>
<td>+0.66</td>
<td>-0.03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>8.5 x 24.8</td>
<td>+3.08</td>
<td>+0.03</td>
<td>+0.47</td>
<td>-0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>12.0 x 35.0</td>
<td>+2.35</td>
<td>+0.03</td>
<td>+0.07</td>
<td>-0.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TABLE V. The modeling error $\delta_{\text{mod}}$ in the mathematical model due to the finite-sized domain for the drag coefficient $C_D$ and the length of the wake $L$ for a highly impermeable disk. The values for the width $W$ and height $H$ refer to the radial and axial extent of the domain in disk diameters, respectively. All computations are performed on grid 6: see Table I.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Domain</th>
<th>$W \times H$</th>
<th>$\delta_{\text{mod},C_D}$ (%)</th>
<th>$\delta_{\text{mod},L}$ (%)</th>
<th>$\delta_{\text{mod},C_D}$ (%)</th>
<th>$\delta_{\text{mod},L}$ (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>4.2 x 12.4</td>
<td>+3.38</td>
<td>+0.14</td>
<td>+1.20</td>
<td>+0.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>6.0 x 17.5</td>
<td>+1.22</td>
<td>+0.06</td>
<td>+0.43</td>
<td>+0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>8.5 x 24.8</td>
<td>+0.40</td>
<td>+0.02</td>
<td>+0.22</td>
<td>+0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>12.0 x 35.0</td>
<td>+0.17</td>
<td>+0.02</td>
<td>+0.18</td>
<td>+0.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

in Table IV). We obtain the solution within each domain, using the same grid, and compute $C_{D,i}$ and $L_i$ in each case. We define the relative domain size $W_{\text{ref}}/W_i$ as the ratio of the width of the reference domain (our reference domain is domain B) to the width of the $i$th domain and $\phi_i = C_{D,i}/C_{D,i,\text{ref}}$ as the ratio of $\phi$ computed in the $i$th domain to $\phi$ computed in the reference domain. As $W_{\text{ref}}/W_i$ approaches zero, the fit of $\phi_i$ should converge to $\phi = \phi_0$, which approximates the value obtained using an infinite domain. We obtain the value for $\phi_0$ by fitting a curve through the obtained data using a similar method outlined in Appendix A1. The error introduced due to the choice of finite domain is then calculated using

$$\delta_{\text{mod,}C_D} = 1 - \phi_0.$$

The results of this study are summarized in Table IV. We note that the modeling error is typically positive and smaller than 1% for all computed quantities on domain B (the domain used in the main body of this paper). However, for low $Re$, the magnitude of this error rises to over 3% for $C_{D,i}$. Note that the sign of this error is positive for $C_{D,i}$, meaning that our simulation results are always an overestimate of the true result. This is consistent with our validation results above, which showed that the solution was validated at $Re = 130$ but not at $Re = 10$ and that the modeling error was approximately $\delta \pm U_{\text{num}} = 5.85\% \pm 4.17\%$. Hence, we identify that the main source of the modeling error for $Re = 10$ is the finite size of the domain.

In order to check that the modeling errors are the same order of magnitude for $C_D$ as they are for $C_{D,i}$, we follow the same procedure as described above, but for the case of a permeable disk. The error due to the use of a finite domain size for permeable disks is summarized in Table V, where we find that the errors are of the same order of magnitude as found for $C_{D,i}$; we note that the error in $C_D$ and $C_{D,i}$ at low $Re$ is consistently higher than at higher $Re$ and that the error in $C_{D,i}$ is significantly higher than the error in $C_D$ at $Re = 10$. A plot of the error in $\phi_i = C_D/C_{D,\text{ref}}$ (for $Re = 10$) versus relative domain size for grid 6 is shown in Fig. 11, where $W_{\text{ref}}/W_i$ is the ratio of the width of the reference domain (domain B) to the width of the $i$th domain.

![FIG. 11. The convergence of $\phi = C_D$ (for $Re = 10$) as the size of the domain is increased. The modeling error due to the finite grid is indicated by $\delta_{\text{mod,C_D}}$. The error bars indicate the numerical uncertainty, $U_{\text{num}}$, at a 95% confidence level in $C_D$ (see Table I).](image-url)
APPENDIX B: DERIVATION OF EQ. (9)

In the absence of a permeable disk, the velocity field is its freestream value throughout the domain. In the highly permeable regime, we expand \( u \) and \( p \) in an asymptotic series, in which the small parameter \( \gamma \ll 1 \) is a measure of the deviation from uniform flow, \[
\begin{align*}
\mathbf{u} &= \mathbf{u}^{(0)} + \gamma \mathbf{u}^{(1)}(r, z) + \mathcal{O}(\gamma^2), \\
p &= p^{(0)}(r, z) + \gamma p^{(1)}(r, z) + \mathcal{O}(\gamma^2),
\end{align*}
\]
where \( \mathbf{u}^{(i)} \) and \( p^{(i)} \) are \( \mathcal{O}(1) \), \( \gamma \ll 1 \), and \( \mathbf{u}^{(0)} \) is the leading-order uniform flow. We insert the expansions (B1) and (B2) into (4) and (5), which yields
\[
\nabla p^{(0)}(r, z) = 0,
\]
in the fluid domain, and
\[
0 = -\nabla p^{(0)}(r, z) - \frac{1}{Da Re} \mathbf{u}^{(0)},
\]
in the porous region. The difference in pressure between the upstream and downstream face \( \Delta p \) is then approximated by
\[
\Delta p^{(0)} = \frac{1}{\chi Da Re},
\]
and the resulting expression, Eq. (9), follows. Similar equations to Eq. (9) have been derived for a 2D circular cylinder and a permeable sphere.\(^{21}\)


